ABSTRACT

Introduction: We investigated sampling methods being used to estimate the HIV prevalence rate among female commercial sex workers. **Methods:** The studies were classified according to the adequacy or not of the sample size to estimate HIV prevalence rate and according to the sampling method (probabilistic or convenience). **Results:** We identified 75 studies that estimated the HIV prevalence rate among female sex workers. Most of the studies employed convenience samples. The sample size was not adequate to estimate HIV prevalence rate in 35 studies. **Discussion:** The use of convenience sample limits statistical inference for the whole group. It was observed that there was an increase in the number of published studies since 2005, as well as in the number of studies that used probabilistic samples. This represents a large advance in the monitoring of risk behavior practices and HIV prevalence rate in this group.

Keywords: HIV, AIDS, commercial sex workers, sampling.

[Braz J Infect Dis 2010;14(4):385-397]©Elsevier Editora Ltda. Este é um artigo Open Access sob a licença de CC BY-NC-ND

INTRODUCTION

The several measures being adopted to prevent HIV dissemination, both at national and international levels, are based on the natural history of the infection, the experience of AIDS-related health programs, and the results of simulations and mathematical models that seek to translate the dynamics of the disease transmission.¹

From the epidemiological point of view, it is known that there are population subgroups presenting a higher risk of HIV-infection, such as men who have sex with other men (MSM), injection drug users (IDU), and female commercial sex workers (SW), who are the most affected and have been infected on the early days of the epidemics. It is also known that sexually-transmitted diseases (STD) act as cofactors to promote disease transmission; and that sexual practices, such as multiple sex partners and irregular condom use are important determinants.²

From mathematical models' point of view, sexual relations patterns among the population subgroups constitute other important factor in the dissemination of HIV, as small alterations in the rate of contacts between the low-risk segment and the high-risk one can significantly change the dissemination of the epidemics.³ The AIDS epidemics in Brazil took place during the first years of the 80's. Throughout this period of more than 20 years, it has been shown to be a concentrated epidemics,⁴ maintaining a prevalence rate of HIV infection in the general population lower than 1% and high rates in the population subgroups that are more vulnerable to HIV infection, such as SW.⁶

The SW group size is estimated at 1% of the Brazilian female population, aged 15 to 49 years, corresponding to more than half a million women.⁷ The prevalence rate for this population group according to some studies carried out in the country, has been estimated to be always higher than that of the general female population. In the study carried out in the city of Santos, state of São Paulo, Brazil, in 1997, the prevalence rate was of 8%.8 In another study carried out between 2000 and 2001, with 2,712 female sex workers in some cities of Brazil, the prevalence rate was estimated at 6.1%.6 These studies indicate a prevalence that is approximately 15fold higher among the commercial sex workers when compared to the Brazilian female population as a whole.⁵ It is noteworthy to mention, however, that convenience samples have been used and, therefore, these results must be interpreted considering such limitation.

Authors Ana Roberta Pati Pascom¹ Célia Landmann Szwarcwald² Aristides Barbosa Júnior¹

¹Monitoring and Evaluation Advisory, Brazilian Departament of STD, AIDS and Viral Hepatitis; Ministério da Saúde, Brazil. ²Health Information Laboratory, Health Science and Technology Information and Communication, Fundação Oswaldo Cruz, Brazil.

Submitted on: 03/05/2010 Approved on: 03/20/2010

Correspondence to: Ana Roberta Pati Pascom SAF Sul Trecho 02, Bloco F, Torre 1, Edificio Premium, Auditório – Brasília/DF – Brazil CEP: 70070-600 Phone: +55-61-33067003;

+55-61-33067079 E-mail: ana.roberta@aids.

gov.br

We declare no conflict of interest.

From the year 2005 on, the United Nations Joint Program on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS) has emphasized the need to monitor indicators in the groups at higher risk of HIVinfection in countries with concentrated epidemics. In Brazil, current efforts are being made to carry out several studies that allow the estimation of the prevalence of HIV and other STDs and characterize the risk practices and behavior in the groups at higher risk of HIV infection, particularly SW.

The higher risk among the SW suggested by previous studies requires studies with a probabilistic sampling to attain adequate monitoring of the risk practices related to HIV-infection. Currently, obtaining representative samples of population subgroups of hard-to-reach individuals, such as commercial sex workers, is one of the biggest challenges for epidemiologic surveillance.⁹ Traditional sampling methods are inadequate to generate representative samples, considering that, to estimate solid enough parameters, it is necessary to select very large samples, which are rendered impossible due to operational and cost difficulties.¹⁰

Another challenge in carrying out home-based studies with SW is the fact that this profession is surrounded by a great deal of stigma, which leads many women to not declare themselves as such or to hide their profession from family members and friends. Additionally, many of these women do not live in permanent private homes of their own, very often residing at their workplaces, which are not included in the traditional researches.

The present study carried out a literature review of scientific articles to investigate the sampling methodologies that are being used in studies estimating the prevalence rate of HIV among SW.

METHODOLOGY

A literature review was carried out through a systematic search of scientific articles involving SW and the estimate of the HIV prevalence rate. The search for articles was conducted between October and November 2008, and was attained through the MEDLINE and PUBMED databases.

This review consisted of cross-sectional studies that: included the population group of SW; estimated the HIV prevalence rate through serological tests; and that had been published in English, Portuguese or Spanish, from 2000 to 2008. We excluded review articles, clinical trials or longitudinal studies, as well as studies that did not include the estimate of the HIV prevalence rate through serological tests.

The multiple combinations of the following keywords were used during the systematic search: "HIV"; "prevalence"; "AIDS"; "female"; "women"; "prostitution"; "CSW"; "commercial sex workers"; "sex workers"; and "SW". The following data were collected for the systematization of the information obtained from the selected articles: year of publication; country where the study was carried out; type of sampling; whether the sampling design was considered in data analysis; sample size; and the HIV prevalence rate.

The studies were classified according to the adequacy or not of the sample size used to estimate the HIV prevalence rate. For that purpose, the estimate error for simple random samples was calculated using the following formula:

Error =
$$z \sqrt{\frac{pq}{n}}$$

Where p = HIV prevalence rate; q = 1 - p; n = sample size; and z = 1.96, which is the value established for 95% confidence. When the error was > p/2 (half the HIV prevalence rate), the sample size was considered to be inadequate.

We also analyzed the type of sampling technique used in the study, classified as probabilistic method or convenience sampling method. Convenience samples are those in which the population elements are chosen according to their availability to participate in the study or the researcher's interest.¹³ Among the studies with convenience samples, we specifically identified the "snowball sampling". In this type of sampling, the selection of the individuals is carried out by the participants themselves, through the indication of acquaintances until the established sample size is achieved.¹⁴

In probabilistic samples, each element of the population is associated with a known selection probability and is different from zero.^{13,15} Among the studies with probabilistic sampling are the conglomerate sampling and the respondent driven sampling (RDS). The conglomerate sampling is a probabilistic sampling employed very often in population surveys, in which the sampling unit is the conglomerate.^{13,15} Proposed by Heckathorn¹⁶ in 1997, the RDS is a variant of chain-based sampling and, as such, assumes that hard-to-reach members of a population are better at recruiting their peers than other individuals, such as healthcare agents or researchers. Moreover, it introduces a mathematical model that allows the weighing of the sample to compensate the bias generated by the non-random selection of the seed-individuals and overrepresentation of some subgroups in the studied population.

The studies were classified regarding their quality, according to the following criteria: 1) only the sample size was adequate; 2) the study used a probabilistic sampling method; 3) the sample size was adequate and the study used a probabilistic sampling method; and 4) the sample size was adequate, the study used a probabilistic sampling method and considered the sampling design at the analysis of the study.

RESULTS

Initially, 1,197 scientific indexed articles were identified during the search at the PUBMED database, using the aforementioned keywords, of which 921 were excluded as they did not meet the established eligibility criteria. Of the remaining 276 articles, 201 were excluded due to duplicity. Thus, 75 articles were included in this review.

Table 1 presents information on the 75 articles included in the study, such as: authorship; year of publication; country where the study was carried out; sampling type; whether the sampling design was considered in data analysis; sample size and HIV prevalence rate.

Year of publication	Year of the study	Citation	Country	Sampling type	Considered the design at the analysis	-	HIV prevalence rate
2000	1998-99	Azim <i>et al.</i> , 2000 ⁴⁴	Bangladesh	Convenience	No	Fluctuating: 400 Brothel A: 392 Brothel B: 267	Fluctuating: 0.3% Brothel A: 2.8% Brothel B: 2.6%
2000	ND	Ohshige <i>et al.</i> , 2000 ⁴⁵	Cambodia	Convenience	No	202	54%
2000	1997-98	Ford <i>et al.</i> , 2000 ⁴⁶	Indonesia	Convenience	No	614	1/631 (0.158%)
2001	1997-98	Morison <i>et al.</i> , 2001 ³¹	Sub-Saharan Africa	Cluster sampling	Yes	Cotonou: 433 Yaoundé: 328 Kisumu: 300 Ndola: 332	Cotonou: 55% Yaoundé: 34% Kisumu: 74% Ndola: 69%
2001	1998-99	van den Hoek <i>et al.</i> , 2001 ⁴⁷	China	Convenience	No	966	1.4%
2001	1998	Aklilu <i>et al.</i> , 2001 ⁴⁸	Ethiopia	Convenience	No	372	73.7% (95% CI: 69.2%-78.2%)
2001	1997-99	Asamoah-Adu et al., 2001 ⁴⁹	Ghana	Convenience	No	1013	50%
2001	1995-99	DAntuono <i>et al.</i> , 2001 ⁵⁰ (Abstract)	Italy	Convenience	No	558	9/558 (1.6%)
2001	1997-98	Verster <i>et al.</i> , 2001 ⁵¹	Italy	Convenience	No	102	5.6%
2001	ND	Ishi <i>et al.</i> , 2001 ⁵²	Japan	Convenience	No	308	0%
2002	1993 1995-96 1999	Alary <i>et al.</i> , 2002 ⁵³	Benin	Convenience	No	1993: 374 1995-96: 365 1998-99: 591	1993: 53% 1995-96: 49.4% 1998-99: 40.6%
2002	1999-2000	Chan <i>et al.</i> , 2002 ⁵⁴ (Abstract)	China	N/A	N/A	1451	0.1%
2002	1992 1998	Ghys <i>et al.</i> , 2002 ⁵⁵	Ivory Coast	Convenience	No	1992: 356 1998: 853	1992 = 89% 1998 = 32%
2002	1997-98 1998	Ford <i>et al.</i> , 2002 ⁵⁶	Indonesia	Convenience	No	1997-98: 631 1998: 629	1997-98: 1/600 (0.16%) 1998: 1/600 (0.16%)
	1998-99 1999					1998-99: 614 1999: 618	1998-99: = 2/598 (0.33%) 1999: = 2/544
							(0.37%)

Year of publication	Year of the study	Citation	Country	Sampling type	Considered th design at the analysis		HIV prevalence rate
2002	ND	Bakare <i>et al.</i> , 2002 ⁵⁷ (Abstract)	Nigeria	Convenience	No	169	34.3%
2002	1998-99	Mgone <i>et al.</i> , 2002 ⁵⁸	Papua New Guinea	Convenience	No	407	10%
2002	2000	Hawken <i>et al.</i> , 2002 ⁵⁹	Kenya	Snowball	No	503	30.6%
2003	ND	Sopheab <i>et al.</i> , 2003 ⁶⁰ (Abstract)	Cambodia	ND	No	114	42%
2003	2000	Desai <i>et al.</i> , 2003 ⁶¹	India	Convenience	No	124	43.2%
2003	1999	Davies <i>et al.</i> , 2003 ⁶²	Indonesia	Convenience	No	288	0% (95% CI: 0%-1.29%)
2003	1999- 2000	Miyazaki <i>et al.</i> , 2003 ⁶³	Japan	Convenience	No	171	0%
2003	1999	Behets <i>et al.</i> , 2003 ⁶⁴	Madagascar	Convenience	No	986	0.2% (2/986)
2003	1998-99	Xueref <i>et al.</i> , 2003 ⁶⁵	Madagascar	Convenience	No	316	0%
2003	1994-95	Uribe-Salas <i>et al.</i> , 2003 ⁶⁶	Mexico	Convenience	No	484	0.6%
2003	1997-2001	Resl <i>et al.</i> , 2003 ⁶⁷	Czech Republic	Convenience	No	561	0.18%
2003	2000	Laurent <i>et al.</i> , 2003 ³²	Senegal	Cluster sampling	Yes	390	HIV-1: 6% (95% CI: 2.8%-9.1%) HIV-2: 3.6% (95% CI: 1.6%-5.7%) HIV-1+2: 0.4% (95% CI: 0%-1.1%)
2003	1999	Camejo <i>et al.</i> , 2003 ⁶⁸	Venezuela	Convenience	No	212	0%
2004	1999-2000	Belza <i>et al.</i> , 2004 ⁶⁹	Spain	Convenience	No	579	0.17% (95% CI: 0.01%-1.12%)
2004	2000-01	Belza <i>et al.</i> , 2004 ⁷⁰	Spain	Convenience	No	3149	0.7%
2004	1998-2000	Pal <i>et al.</i> , 2004 ⁷¹ (Abstract)	India	Convenience	No	867	13.2%
2004	2000	Nguyen <i>et al.</i> , 2004 ⁷²	Vietnam	Convenience	No	398	16.3%
2005	ND	Dunkle <i>et al.</i> , 2005 ⁷³ (Abstract)	South Africa	NA	NA	295	46.7%
2005	1999-2000	Chen <i>et al.</i> , 2005 ¹⁸	China	Convenience	No	505	10.3% (95% CI: 7.6%-13%)
2005	2000-01	Ding <i>et al.</i> , 2005 ⁷⁴	China	Snowball	No	621	0.4%
2005	2004	Sarkar <i>et al.</i> , 2005 ⁷⁵	India	Convenience		622 tested 62 behavior questionnair	al 9.6%

Year of Publicat	Year of ion the study	Citation	Country	Sampling type	Considered th design at the analysis	-	HIV prevalence rate
2005	2002	Jahani <i>et al.</i> , 2005 ⁷⁶	Iran	Convenience	No	149	0%
2005	ND	Gare <i>et al.</i> , 2005 ¹⁹	Papua New Guinea	Convenience	No	211	0%
2005	2002	Tran <i>et al.</i> , 2005 ²¹	Vietnam	Cluster sampling	g Yes	400	12% (95% CI: 8.6%-15%)
2005	ND	Cowan <i>et al.</i> , 2005 ⁷⁷	Zimbabwe	Convenience	No	363	55.7% (95% CI: 50.6%-60.9%)
2006	1999-2002	Bautista <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ²⁵	Latin America	Convenience	No	13,600	1.2% (0%-4.5%)
2006	2000-02	Pando <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁷⁸	Argentina	Convenience	No	625	3.2% (0%-6.1%)
2006	2004-05	Ruan <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁷⁹	China	Convenience	No	343	0.6%
2006	2005	Papadogeorgaki <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁸⁰	Greece	Convenience	No	299	0%
2006	2000	Allen <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁸¹	Guiana	Snowball	No	299 (241 tested)	30.6%
2006	2004	Sarkar <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁸²	India	Convenience	No	2076	5.9% (95%CI: 4.9%-6.9%)
2006	ND	Cwikel <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁸³	Israel	Convenience	No	43	0%
2006	2001-02	Nigro <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁸⁴	Italy	Convenience	NA	118	0%
2006	2004-05	Patterson <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁸⁵	Mexico	NA	No	295	Tijuana: 4.8% Ciudad Juarez: 4.9%
2006	1999-2000	Bruckova <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁸⁶	Czech Republi	c Convenience	No	585	0.7% (95% CI: 0.2-1.7)
2006	2002	Pisani <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁸⁷	East Timor	Convenience	No	100	3%
2006	2003-04	Todd <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ⁸⁸	Uzbekistan	Convenience	No	448	10%
2006	2004	Johnston <i>et al.</i> , 2006 ²⁸	Vietnam	RDS	Yes	Ho Chi Minh City (HCMC) = 413 Hai Phong (HP) = 215	HCMC:) Visible = 14.5%; Semi-visible = 13.8%; Non-visible = 13.5%; HP: Visible = 35.2%; Semi-visible = 30.2%; Non-visible = 30%
2007	2004	Mosoko <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ⁸⁹	Cameroon	Convenience	No	1005	26.4% (95% CI: 23.6%-29.2%)
2007	ND	Barrientos <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ⁹⁰	Chile	Stratified random sample	Yes	626	0%
2007	2003-04	Lau <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ⁹¹	China	Convenience	No	293	0%

Year of publication	Year of n the study	Citation C	ountry	Sampling type	Considered t design at th analysis	-	HIV prevalence rate
2007	ND	Lau <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ³⁸	China	Convenience	No	336	0%
2007	2000-03	Vall-Mayans <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ⁹²	Spain	Convenience	No	301	1%
2007	2005	Enkhbold <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ⁹³	Mongolia	Convenience	No	342	0%
2007	2002	Hagan & Dulmaa, 2007 ³⁷	Mongolia	Snowball	No	179	0%
2007	ND	Chersich <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ⁹⁴ (Summary)	Kenya	Snowball		Never drank: 161 Drank sometime during life: 558	Never drank: 23.2% Drank sometime during life: 39.9%
2007	2002	Vandepitte <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ⁹⁵	Democratic Republic of Congo	Convenience	No	502 (of 585 recruited)	Total: 12.4% Hotel = 11.8%; Home = 24%; Street = 20%; Phaseures = 10%; Masquées = 6.6%
2007	2000-04	Wang <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ⁹⁶ (Abstract)	Senegal	Convenience	No	1,052	19.8%
2007	2004	Vu <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ⁹⁷	Vietnam	Convenience	No	982	2002: 4.5% 2004: 3.6%
2007	2002-04	Tuan <i>et al.</i> , 2007 ³³	Vietnam C	ີ:luster samplinຄູ	g No	Lai Chau: street = 54; karaoke = 49 Kien Giang: street = 216; karaoke = 449 Dong Thap: street = 201; karaoke = 291 An Giang: street = 400; karaoke = 363	Lai Chau: street =1.9%; karaoke = 0% Kien Giang: street = 0%; karaoke = 1.3% Dong Thap: street = 1.5%; karaoke = 1.4% An Giang: street = 24.3%; karaoke = 16.5%
2008	2006	Xu <i>et al.</i> , 200898	China	Convenience	No	96	8.3%
2008	2004	Ngo et al., 200899	China	Convenience	No	310	3.9%
2008	2006	Wang et al., 2008 ¹⁰⁰		Convenience	No	737	76/737 (10.3%)
2008	2005	Folch <i>et al.</i> , 2008 ¹⁰¹	-	Convenience	No	357	0.8%
2008	2005-06	Uusküla <i>et al.</i> , 2008 ²⁹	Estonia	RDS	No	227	7.6% (95% CI: 4.6%-12.5%)
2008	2002-05	van Veen <i>et al.</i> , 2008 ¹⁰²	Holland	Convenience	No	399	1.5% (95% CI: 0.6%-3.2%)
2008	2004-05	Shahmanesh <i>et al.</i> , 2008 ³⁰	India	RDS	Yes	326	25.7% (95% CI: 21%-31.1%)
2008	ND	Linhart <i>et al.</i> , 2008 ¹⁰	³ Israel	Convenience	No	300	1/300 (0.33%)
2008	2004-05	Strathdee et al., 2008 ¹⁰⁴	Mexico	Convenience	N/A	924	6%
2008	2006	Imade <i>et al.</i> , 2008 ¹⁰⁵	Nigeria	Convenience	N/A	398	Vaginal douche users: 48.8% Non-users: 48.2%
2008	2000 2005	Luchters <i>et al.</i> , 2008 ¹⁷	Kenya	Snowball	No	2000: 503 2005: 506	2000: 30.6% 2005: 33.3%

Almost 50% of the selected studies (48.3%) were published after 2006, and around 25% of them were published between 2000 and 2002 (Table 2).

Although the studies were published in 31 different journals, 49.3% of them were published in four journals: Sexually Transmitted Diseases; Sexually Transmitted Infections; AIDS; and International Journal of STD & AIDS.

Regarding the country where the study was carried out, almost half of the studies were carried out in only eight countries. Most of them were carried out in China (10) and around 7% in India (5) and Vietnam (5), and 5.3% in Spain. Three studies (4%) were carried out in each of the following countries: Indonesia, Italy, Mexico and Kenya.

Considering the region where the study was carried out, 42.7% of them were carried out in the Eastern, Southern and Southeastern Asia; 26.7% in the Sub-Saharan Africa; 10.7% in Latin America; and 2.7% in Eastern Europe and Central Asia (Table 2).

Table 2. Distribution of studies selected according to publication year, journal, country, and region where the study was carried out. 2000-2008

Characteristics	Number of studies	Distribution (%)
Total	75	100.0%
Year		
2000	3	4.0
2001	7	9.3
2002	7	9.3
2003	10	13.3
2004	4	5.3
2005	8	10.7
2006	13	17.3
2007	12	16.0
2008	11	14.7
Publication Journal		
Sexually Transmitted Diseases	13	17.3
Sexually Transmitted Infections	12	16.0
AIDS	7	9.3
International Journal of STD & AIDS	5	6.7
Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes	5	6.7
AIDS Care	3	4.0
Other	30	40.0
Country where study was carried out		
China	10	13.3
India	5	6.7
Vietnam	5	6.7
Spain	4	5.3
Indonesia	3	4.0
Italy	3	4.0
Mexico	3	4.0
Kenya	3	4.0
Other	39	52.0
Region where study was carried out		
East Asia	14	18.7
Eastern Europe and Central Asia	2	2.7
Latin America	8	10.7
South and Southeast Asia	18	24.0
Sub-Saharan Africa	20	26.7
Western and Central Europe	13	17.3

Table 3 shows the results related to the sampling design and the adequacy of the sample size. A total of 84% (63) of the selected studies used convenience samples, and 8% (6) employed the snowball sampling method. It was not possible to obtain information on the type of sampling used in around 5% of the studies, as the authors had no access to the complete study text. Of eight studies that used probabilistic sampling, four used cluster sampling and three used RDS. Six studies with probabilistic sampling (75%) were carried out after 2006 and, among them, the three that used RDS. The studies that used RDS were carried out in Estonia, India and Vietnam. Two of the four studies that used cluster sampling were carried out in Vietnam.

Of the eight studies with probabilistic sampling, six had the sampling design considered at the analysis. One used a stratified sampling with proportional allocation and random selection in the strata; two used RDS and performed the analysis using the software program specific for the method (RDSAT®); and three used cluster sampling and considered the design effect at the analysis.

It was verified that the sample size was adequate for the estimation of the HIV prevalence rate in 53.3% of the studies (Table 3). Among the 35 studies that had an inadequate sample size for the estimation of HIV prevalence rate according to the criterion used in the present study, the prevalence rate was estimated at zero (0) in 16 of them.

The classification of the studies according to the quality criterion is shown in Table 4. Almost 50% of the studies (36) did not meet any of the adopted quality criteria. In 30 studies (40.5%), only the sample size was adequate, without using the probabilistic sampling method. Three studies, published from 2005 to 2008, used probabilistic methods, but the sample size was not adequate and the study design was not considered at the analysis. Only four of the analyzed studies had an adequate sample size for the estimation of the HIV prevalence rate, used a probabilistic method of sampling and considered the sampling design of the study at the analysis.

Table 3. Absolute (n) and percentage (%) distribution of articles selected according to sampling design, samplesize adequacy, and whether the study design was considered at the analysis

		n	%
	Convenience	63	84.0
	Snowball	6	8.0
	Probabilistic	8	10.7
Sampling method	Stratified random sample	1	1.3
Sampling method	Cluster sampling	4	5.3
	RDS	3	4.0
	No information	4	5.3
	Total	75	100.0
	Yes	6	75.0
Sampling design was considered at the analysis*	No	2	25.0
	Total	8	100.0
	Adequate	40	53.3
Sample size	Not adequate	35	46.7
	Total	75	100.0

*Only among studies with probabilistic sampling.

Table 4. Classification of the selected studies according to the quality criteria

Quality criteria	2000-2004	2005-2008	2000-2008
Did not meet any of the criteria	15	21	36
Only sample size was adequate	13	17	30
Use of probabilistic method	0	3	3
Adequate sample size and use of probabilistic method	0	1	1
Adequate sample size, use of probabilistic method and design considered in analysis	2	2	4
Total	30	44	74

It was not possible to classify one of the studies (Chan *et al.*, 2002) as it did not provide information on the method used, or whether the study design was considered at the analysis.

DISCUSSION

The present study used the aforementioned keywords to identify 75 cross-sectional studies with female commercial sex workers that estimated the HIV prevalence rate. The studies supply information on 61,075 female SW and were carried out in 35 different countries, of which 10 were located in Asia. Many of the studies were published after 2006 and were concentrated in four scientific journals.

The higher risk among the female SW was observed in many of the countries where the studies reviewed here were carried out. Luchters *et al*,¹⁷ in their study carried out in Kenya, emphasized that, in spite of the decrease in the HIV prevalence rate observed in the female population, there was no evidence that these changes were occurring among the higher-risk populations, such as the SW. The findings of a study conducted in China equally demonstrated a higher risk among the SW, especially related to the lack of condom use and the low level of education.¹⁸ Considering the importance of this population for the control of the HIV/AIDS epidemics, in a study carried out in New Guinea, the authors pointed out that the development of specific interventions for this population subgroup is a cost-effective strategy for the control of HIV dissemination.¹⁹

This review shows that most of the studies that involved female SW used sampling techniques with non-probabilistic selection. When compared to the probabilistic samples, the convenience samples can generally be implemented more easily, faster and with fewer resources.²⁰ However, any inference to the target-population is limited and difficult to interpret, as the study sample might not be representative of the population as a whole.

In general, although most of the analyzed studies used convenience samples, a mapping of the prostitution locations was performed before the start of the study and the SW were recruited at those locations. Although this ethnographic component might have contributed to the representativeness of the population group, the probabilities of selection remain unknown, which prevents any statistical estimate or inference.^{18,21} Additionally, the SW that work in locations that were not mapped in the study, were excluded from it.²²

Snowball sampling was used in 8% of the studies. In spite of its indisputable practical feasibility, several aspects prevent the statistical analysis of the data. First, as there is no maximum number of individuals that each participant can invite to the study, the estimates are biased by the individuals who belong to a larger social network,^{16,23} with the final sample being strongly influenced by the initial participants.⁹ Secondly, there is a structure of dependence between the observations, which is not considered at the analysis. As discussed by Erickson,²⁴ the individuals tend to recruit people who are similar to them, an effect known as homophily. Moreover, the lack of representativeness of the sample can also be observed.²⁵ From 2005 on, there is an increase in the number of articles and studies with probabilistic sampling. This increase is probably associated with the new set of indicators, proposed in 2005, to follow the Declaration of Commitment on HIV/AIDS, established during the 26th United Nations General Assembly Special Session – UNGASS.²⁶ In this new version, in contrast to those proposed in 2002, two distinct sets of indicators were proposed, according to the type of epidemics of the country: concentrated or generalized. For countries with epidemics classified as concentrated, the indicators aimed at the follow-up of populations at higherrisk, determined by the countries themselves, according to the characteristics of their epidemics.²⁷

Additionally, the development and the dissemination of the use of specific and probabilistic sampling methods for the study of populations that are hard to reach brought new possibilities and stimuli for researchers interested in the study of groups at higher-risk for infection HIV. Three studies that utilized probabilistic sampling methods, by using RDS, were the result of this process.²⁸⁻³⁰ In Vietnam, this method showed to be efficient to recruit different types of SW.²⁸

It is worth mentioning, however, that probabilistic sampling methods also present important limitations. In cases of conglomerate sampling, it is difficult to have a complete list of all prostitution locations and the selection probabilities are, in general, unknown, and approximations are considered at the data analysis.^{21,31-33} As for the RDS technique, as the method is still being developed, data analysis is yet quite limited, not allowing multivariate analyses, which are essential for the study of the factors associated with HIV infection.^{28,34-36}

Of the 75 articles analyzed in the present study, 35 presented an insufficient sample size to estimate the HIV prevalence rate with a simple random sample, which is the one that provides the lowest error among the sampling methods.¹³ In 16 articles, the prevalence rate among female SW was of 0%, which might indicate that the sample size was not large enough to detect cases of HIV infection. Nevertheless, only three of the studies discussed the possibility of the result being related to the sample size.^{33,37,38}

As for the quality assessment, most of the selected studies did not meet the quality criteria that would be adequate to estimate the HIV prevalence rate among the SW. In spite of the improvement in study quality in the two analyzed periods, only four studies^{21,30-32} met the established criteria, i.e., having an adequate sample size, using probabilistic sampling method and considering the sampling design at data analysis.

It is also important to mention that not considering the sampling design at the analysis can lead to important errors in the estimation of parameters of interest. By ignoring the sampling design, the traditional statistical analysis, considering the assumed simple random sampling, can result in inaccuracies regarding the mean estimates, as well as for the respective variances, compromising the results, the hypothesis tests and the conclusions of the study.³⁹ In the specific case of RDS, Goel and Salganick⁴⁰ suggest design effects > 4, resulting from homophily between peers, meaning that the structure of dependence between the observations needs to be considered at data analysis.

The present literature review did not identify any Brazilian study. A further investigation at the Scielo database (www.scielo.br) disclosed three studies carried out between 2000 and 2008 in the country: one in Santa Catarina⁴¹ and two in Amazonas.^{42,43} All studies used convenience samples and, according to the criterion adopted in the present article, the sample size was inadequate for the estimation of the HIV prevalence rate in all three of them.

As for the international scenario, the present review showed that some recent studies used a probabilistic sampling technique, which represents a great advance for the monitoring of risk practices and HIV prevalence rates in this population group.

REFERENCES

- 1. Cruz-Grote D. Prevention of HIV infection in developing countries. Lancet 1996; 348:1071-4.
- Potts M, Anderson R, Boily MC. Slowing the spread of human immunodeficiency virus in developing countries. Lancet 1991; 338:608-13.
- Boily MC, Mâsse B. Mathematical models of disease transmission: a precious tool for the study of sexually transmitted diseases. Can J Public Health 1997; 88:255-65.
- Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS). 2004 Report on the global AIDS epidemic [Internet]. Genebra: Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS); June 2004 [cited 2009 May 12]. Available from http://www. unaids.org/bangkok2004/GAR2004_html/GAR2004_00_ en.htm.
- Szwarcwald CL, Barbosa Júnior A, de Souza-Júnior PR *et al.* HIV testing during pregnancy: use of secondary data to estimate 2006 test coverage and prevalence in Brazil. Braz J Infect Dis. 2008; 12:167-72.
- Ministério da Saúde Coordenação Nacional de DST e Aids (Brasil). Avaliação da efetividade das ações de prevenção dirigidas às profissionais do sexo, em três regiões brasileiras. Coleção DST/Aids – Série Estudos, Pesquisas e Avaliação nº 7. Brasília: 2004.
- Szwarcwald CL, Barbosa-Júnior A, Pascom ARP, Souza-Júnior PR. Knowledge, practices and behaviors related to HIV transmission among the Brazilian population in the 15–54 years age group, 2004. AIDS 2005 19(Suppl 4):S51-S58.
- Szwarcwald CL, Bastos FI, Gravato N, Lacerda R, Chequer PN, Castilho EA. The relationship of illicit drug use to use to HIV infection among commercial sex workers in the city of Santos, São Paulo, Brazil. Int J Drug Policy 1998; 9:427-36.
- 9. Magnani R, Sabin K, Saidel T, Heckathorn D. Review of sampling hard-to-reach and hidden populations for HIV surveillance. AIDS 2005; 19:S67-72.

- 10. Frank O, Snijders T. Estimating the size of hidden populations using snowball sampling. J Off Stat 1994; 10:53-67.
- Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UN-AIDS). 2008 Report on the global AIDS epidemic [Internet]. Genebra: Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS); July 2008 [cited 2009 May 1st]. Available from http://www.unaids.org/en/KnowledgeCentre/HIVData/ GlobalReport/2008/.
- U.S. Census Bureau. International Data Base [Internet]. [cited 2009 May 1st] Available from http://www.census.gov/cgibin/ipc/idbagg.
- 13. Scheaffer RL, Medenhall III W, Ott RL. Elementary Survey Sampling. USA: Duxbury Press, 1996.
- Goodman L. Snowball Sampling. Annals of Mathematical Statistics 1961; 32:148-70.
- 15. Cochran, Gemmell W. Sampling Techniques. 3rd ed. USA: John Wiley & Sons, Inc, 1977.
- Heckathorn DD. Respondent-driven sampling: a new approach to the study of hidden populations. Soc Probl 1997; 44:174-99.
- 17. Luchters S, Chersich MF, Rinyiru A *et al.* Impact of five years of peer-mediated interventions on sexual behavior and sexually transmitted infections among female sex workers in Mombasa, Kenya. BMC Public Health 2008; 8:143.
- Chen XS, Yin YP, Liang GJ *et al.* Sexually transmitted infections among female sex workers in Yunnan, China. AIDS Patient Care STDS 2005; 19:853-60.
- 19. Gare J, Lupiwa T, Suarkia DL *et al.* High prevalence of sexually transmitted infections among female sex workers in the eastern highlands province of Papua New Guinea: correlates and recommendations. Sex Transm Dis 2005; 32:466-73.
- 20. Shapiro MF, Berk ML, Berry SH *et al.* National probability samples in studies of low-prevalence diseases Part I: Perspectives and lessons from the HIV cost and services utilization study. Health Serv Res 1999; 34:951-68.
- 21. Tran TN, Detels R, Long HT, Van Phung L, Lan HP. HIV infection and risk characteristics among female sex workers in Hanoi, Vietnam. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 2005; 39:581-6.
- 22. Minh TT, Nhan DT, West GR *et al.* Sex workers in Vietnam: how many, how risky? AIDS Educ Prev 2004; 16:389-404.
- 23. Heckathorn DD. Respondent-driven sampling II: deriving valid population estimates from chain-referral samples of hidden populations. Soc Probl 2002; 49:11-34.
- 24. Erickson BH. Some problems of inference from chain data. Sociol Methodol 1979; 10:276-302.
- 25. Bautista CT, Sanchez JL, Montano SM *et al.* Seroprevalence of and risk factors for HIV-1 infection among female commercial sex workers in South America. Sex Transm Infect 2006; 82:311-6.
- UNAIDS (Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS). 2005. Monitoring the Declaration of Commitment on HIV/ AIDS: Guidelines on Constructions of Core Indicators. Geneva: UNAIDS, 2005.
- Barbosa Junior A, Pascom AR, Szwarcwald CL, Dhalia CB, Monteiro L, Simão MB. Proposed UNGASS indicators and the monitoring of the AIDS epidemic in Brazil. Rev Saude Publica 2006; 40(Suppl 1):94-100.
- Johnston LG, Sabin K, Mai TH, Pham TH. Assessment of respondent driven sampling for recruiting female sex workers in two Vietnamese cities: reaching the unseen sex worker. J Urban Health 2006; 83(Suppl 6):i16-28.
- 29. Uusküla A, Fischer K, Raudne R *et al*. A study on HIV and hepatitis C virus among commercial sex workers in Tallinn. Sex Transm Infect 2008; 84:189-91.

- 30. Shahmanesh M, Cowan FM, Wayal SS, Copas A, Patel V, Mabey D. The burden and determinants of HIV and sexually transmitted infections in a population based sample of female sex workers in Goa, India. Sex Transm Infect 2009; 85:50-9.
- 31. Morison L, Weiss HA, Buvé A *et al.* Study Group on Heterogeneity of HIV Epidemics in African Cities. Commercial sex and the spread of HIV in four cities in sub-Saharan Africa. AIDS 2001;15(Suppl 4):S61-9.
- 32. Laurent C, Seck K, Coumba N *et al.* Prevalence of HIV and other sexually transmitted infections, and risk behaviors in unregistered sex workers in Dakar, Senegal. AIDS 2003; 17:1811-6.
- 33. Tuan NA, Fylkesnes K, Thang BD *et al.* Human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) infection patterns and risk behaviors in different population groups and provinces in Vietnam. Bull World Health Organ 2007; 85:35-41.
- 34. Salganik MJ, Heckathorn DD. Sampling and Estimation in Hidden Populations Using Respondent-Driven Sampling. Sociol Methodol 2004; 34:193-239.
- 35. Salganik MJ. Variance estimation, design effects, and sample size calculations for respondent-driven sampling. J Urban Health 2006; 83:i98-112.
- Heckathorn, Douglas D. Extensions of respondent-driven sampling: Analyzing continuous variables and controlling for differential recruitment. Sociological Methodology 2007; 37:151-208.
- Hagan JE, Dulmaa N. Risk factors and prevalence of HIV and sexually transmitted infections among low-income female commercial sex workers in Mongolia. Sex Transm Dis 2007; 34:83-7.
- Lau JT, Tsui HY, Ho SP. Variations in condom use by locale: a comparison of mobile Chinese female sex workers in Hong Kong and mainland China. Arch Sex Behav 2007; 36:849-59.
- Szwarcwald CL, Damacena GN. Amostras complexas em inquéritos populacionais: planejamento e implicações na análise estatística dos dados. Rev bras epidemiol 2008; 11(Suppl.1):38-45.
- 40. Goel S, Salganik MJ. Respondent-driven sampling as Markov chain Monte Carlo. Stat Med 2009; 28:2202-29.
- 41. Trevisol FS, Silva MV. HIV frequency among female sex workers in Imbituba, Santa Catarina, Brazil. Braz J Infect Dis 2005; 9:500-5.
- 42. Benzaken AS, Garcia EG, Sardinha JCG, Pedrosa VL, Loblein O. Baixa prevalência de DST em profissionais do sexo no Município de Manacapuru - interior do Estado do Amazonas, Brasil. J Bras Doenças Sex Transm 2002; 14:9-12.
- 43. Benzaken AS, Sabidó M, Galban EG *et al.* Field evaluation of the performance and testing costs of a rapid point-of-care test for syphilis in a red-light district of Manaus, Brazil. Sex Transm Infect 2008; 84:297-302.
- 44. Azim T, Islam MN, Bogaerts J *et al.* Prevalence of HIV and syphilis among high-risk groups in Bangladesh. AIDS 2000; 14:210-1.
- 45. Ohshige K, Morio S, Mizushima S *et al*. Cross-sectional study on risk factors of HIV among female commercial sex workers in Cambodia. Epidemiol Infect 2000; 124:143-52.
- 46. Ford K, Wirawan DN, Reed BD, Muliawan P, Sutarga M. AIDS and STD knowledge, condom use and HIV/STD infection among female sex workers in Bali, Indonesia. AIDS Care 2000; 12:523-34.
- 47. Van Den Hoek A, Yuliang F, Dukers NH *et al.* High prevalence of syphilis and other sexually transmitted diseases among sex workers in China: potential for fast spread of HIV. AIDS 2001; 15:753-9.

- 48. Aklilu M, Messele T, Tsegaye A *et al.* Factors associated with HIV-1 infection among sex workers of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. AIDS 2001; 15:87-96.
- 49. Asamoah-Adu C, Khonde N, Avorkliah M *et al.* HIV infection among sex workers in Accra: need to target new recruits entering the trade. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 2001; 28:358-66.
- 50. DAntuono A, Andalò F, Carlà EM, De Tommaso S. Prevalence of STDs and HIV infection among immigrant sex workers attending an STD centre in Bologna, Italy. Sex Transm Infect 2001; 77:220.
- Verster A, Davoli M, Camposeragna A, Valeri C, Perucci CA. Prevalence of HIV infection and risk behavior among street prostitutes in Rome, 1997-1998. AIDS Care 2001; 13:367-72.
- 52. Ishi K, Suzuku F, Saito A, Yoshimoto S, Kubota T. Prevalence of human immunodeficiency virus, hepatitis B and hepatitis C virus antibodies and hepatitis B antigen among commercial sex workers in Japan. Infect Dis Obstet Gynecol 2001; 9:215-9.
- 53. Alary M, Mukenge-Tshibaka L, Bernier F *et al.* Decline in the prevalence of HIV and sexually transmitted diseases among female sex workers in Cotonou, Benin, 1993-1999. AIDS 2002; 16:463-70.
- Chan MK, Ho KM, Lo KK. A behavior sentinel surveillance for female sex workers in the Social Hygiene Service in Hong Kong (1999-2000). Int J STD AIDS 2002; 13:815-20.
- 55. Ghys PD, Diallo MO, Ettiègne-Traoré V *et al.* Increase in condom use and decline in HIV and sexually transmitted diseases among female sex workers in Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire, 1991-1998. AIDS 2002; 16:251-8.
- 56. Ford K, Wirawan DN, Reed BD, Muliawan P, Wolfe R. The Bali STD/AIDS Study: evaluation of an intervention for sex workers. Sex Transm Dis 2002; 29:50-8.
- 57. Bakare RA, Oni AA, Umar US *et al.* Pattern of sexually transmitted diseases among commercial sex workers (CSWs) in Ibadan, Nigeria. Afr J Med Med Sci 2002; 31:243-7.
- Mgone CS, Passey ME, Anang J *et al*. Human immunodeficiency virus and other sexually transmitted infections among female sex workers in two major cities in Papua New Guinea. Sex Transm Dis 2002; 29:265-70.
- 59. Hawken MP, Melis RD, Ngombo DT *et al.* Part time female sex workers in a suburban community in Kenya: a vulnerable hidden population. Sex Transm Infect 2002; 78:271-3.
- 60. Sopheab H, Gorbach PM, Gloyd S, Leng HB. Rural sex work in Cambodia: work characteristics, risk behaviors, HIV, and syphilis. Sex Transm Infect 2003; 79:e2.
- 61. Desai VK, Kosambiya JK, Thakor HG, Umrigar DD, Khandwala BR, Bhuyan KK. Prevalence of sexually transmitted infections and performance of STI syndromes against aetiological diagnosis, in female sex workers of red light area in Surat, India. Sex Transm Infect 2003; 79:111-5.
- 62. Davies SC, Otto B, Partohudoyo S *et al*. Sexually transmitted infections among female sex workers in Kupang, Indonesia: searching for a screening algorithm to detect cervical gonococcal and chlamydial infections. Sex Transm Dis 2003; 30:671-9.
- 63. Miyazaki M, Babazono A, Kato M, Takagi S, Chimura H, Une H. Sexually transmitted diseases in Japanese female commercial sex workers working in massage parlors with cell baths. J Infect Chemother 2003; 9:248-53.
- 64. Behets FM, Rasolofomanana JR, Van Damme K *et al*. Evidencebased treatment guidelines for sexually transmitted infections developed with and for female sex workers. Trop Med Int Health 2003; 8:251-8.
- 65. Xueref S, Holianjavony J, Daniel R, Kerouedan D, Fabry J, Vanhems P. The absence of HIV seropositivity contrasts with a high prevalence of markers of sexually transmitted infections among registered female sex workers in Toliary, Madagascar. Trop Med Int Health 2003; 8:60-6.

- 66. Uribe-Salas F, Conde-Glez CJ, Juárez-Figueroa L, Hernández-Castellanos A. Sociodemographic dynamics and sexually transmitted infections in female sex workers at the Mexican-Guatemalan border. Sex Transm Dis 2003; 30:266-71.
- 67. Resl V, Kumpová M, Cerná L, Novák M, Pazdiora P. Prevalence of STDs among prostitutes in Czech border areas with Germany in 1997-2001 assessed in project "Jana". Sex Transm Infect 2003; 79:E3.
- 68. Camejo MI, Mata G, Díaz M. Prevalence of hepatitis B, hepatitis C and syphilis in female sex workers in Venezuela. Rev Saude Publica 2003; 37:339-44.
- 69. Belza MJ, Clavo P, Ballesteros J *et al.* Social and work conditions, risk behavior and prevalence of sexually transmitted diseases among female immigrant prostitutes in Madrid (Spain). Gac Sanit 2004; 18:177-83.
- Belza MJ. Spanish Group for the Unlinked Anonymous Survey of HIV Seroprevalence in STD Patients. Prevalence of HIV, HTLV-I and HTLV-II among female sex workers in Spain, 2000-2001. Eur J Epidemiol 2004; 19:279-82.
- Pal D, Raut DK, Das A. A study of HIV/STD infections amongst commercial sex workers in Kolkata. (India) Part-IV laboratory investigation of STD and HIV infections. J Commun Dis 2004; 36:12-6.
- 72. Nguyen AT, Nguyen TH, Pham KC *et al.* Intravenous drug use among street-based sex workers: a high-risk behavior for HIV transmission. Sex Transm Dis 2004; 31:15-9.
- 73. Dunkle KL, Beksinska ME, Rees VH, Ballard RC, Htun Y, Wilson ML. Risk factors for HIV infection among sex workers in Johannesburg, South Africa. Int J STD AIDS 2005; 16:256-61.
- 74. Ding Y, Detels R, Zhao Z *et al.* HIV infection and sexually transmitted diseases in female commercial sex workers in China. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 2005; 38:314-9.
- 75. Sarkar K, Bal B, Mukherjee R, Niyogi SK, Saha MK, Bhattacharya SK. Epidemiology of HIV infection among brothelbased sex workers in Kolkata, India. J Health Popul Nutr 2005; 23:231-5.
- 76. Jahani MR, Alavian SM, Shirzad H, Kabir A, Hajarizadeh B. Distribution and risk factors of hepatitis B, hepatitis C, and HIV infection in a female population with "illegal social behavior". Sex Transm Infect 2005; 81:185.
- Cowan FM, Hargrove JW, Langhaug LF *et al.* The appropriateness of core group interventions using presumptive periodic treatment among rural Zimbabwean women who exchange sex for gifts or money. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 2005; 38:202-7.
- Pando MA, Berini C, Bibini M *et al.* Prevalence of HIV and other sexually transmitted infections among female commercial sex workers in Argentina. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2006; 74:233-8.
- 79. Ruan Y, Cao X, Qian HZ *et al*. Syphilis among female sex workers in southwestern China: potential for HIV transmission. Sex Transm Dis 2006; 33:719-23.
- Papadogeorgaki H, Caroni C, Frangouli E, Flemetakis A, Katsambas A, Hadjivassiliou M. Prevalence of sexually transmitted infections in female sex workers in Athens, Greece - 2005. Eur J Dermatol 2006; 16:662-5.
- 81. Allen CF, Edwards M, Williamson LM *et al.* Sexually transmitted infection service use and risk factors for HIV infection among female sex workers in Georgetown, Guyana. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 2006; 43:96-101.

- Sarkar K, Bal B, Mukherjee R *et al.* Young age is a risk factor for HIV among female sex workers – an experience from India. J Infect 2006; 53:255-9.
- 83. Cwikel JG, Lazer T, Press F, Lazer S. Sexually transmissible infections among illegal female sex workers in Israel. Sex Health 2006; 3:301-3.
- 84. Nigro L, Larocca L, Celesia BM *et al.* Prevalence of HIV and other sexually transmitted diseases among Colombian and Dominican female sex workers living in Catania, Eastern Sicily. J Immigr Minor Health 2006; 8:319-23.
- 85. Patterson TL, Semple SJ, Fraga M *et al.* Comparison of sexual and drug use behaviors between female sex workers in Tijuana and Ciudad Juarez, Mexico. Subst Use Misuse 2006; 41:1535-49.
- Bruckova M, Bautista CT, Graham RR *et al.* Short report: HIV infection among commercial sex workers and injecting drug users in the Czech Republic. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2006; 75:1017-20.
- Pisani E, Purnomo H, Sutrisna A *et al.* Basing policy on evidence: low HIV, STIs, and risk behavior in Dili, East Timor argue for more focused interventions. Sex Transm Infect 2006; 82:88-93.
- 88. Todd CS, Khakimov MM, Alibayeva G *et al.* Prevalence and correlates of human immunodeficiency virus infection among female sex workers in Tashkent, Uzbekistan. Sex Transm Dis 2006; 33:496-501.
- Mosoko JJ, Macauley IB, Zoungkanyi AC, Bella A, Koulla-Shiro S. Human Immunodeficiency Virus Infection and Associated Factors among Specific Population Subgroups in Cameroon. AIDS Behav 2009; 13:277-87.
- Barrientos JE, Bozon M, Ortiz E, Arredondo A. HIV prevalence, AIDS knowledge, and condom use among female sex workers in Santiago, Chile. Cad Saúde Pública 2007; 23:1777-84.
- 91. Lau JT, Ho SP, Yang X, Wong E, Tsui HY, Ho KM. Prevalence of HIV and factors associated with risk behaviors among Chinese female sex workers in Hong Kong. AIDS Care 2007; 19:721-32.
- 92. Vall-Mayans M, Villa M, Saravanya M *et al.* Sexually transmitted Chlamydia trachomatis, Neisseria gonorrhoeae, and HIV-1 infections in two at-risk populations in Barcelona: female street prostitutes and STI clinic attendees. Int J Infect Dis 2007; 11:115-22.
- 93. Enkhbold S, Tugsdelger S, Morita S, Sakamoto J, Hamajima N. HIV/AIDS related knowledge and risk behaviors among female sex workers in two major cities of Mongolia. Nagoya J Med Sci 2007; 69:157-65.
- 94. Chersich MF, Luchters SM, Malonza IM, Mwarogo P, Kingola N, Temmerman M. Heavy episodic drinking among Kenyan female sex workers is associated with unsafe sex, sexual violence and sexually transmitted infections. Int J STD AIDS 2007; 18:764-9.
- 95. Vandepitte JM, Malele F, Kivuvu DM *et al.* HIV and other sexually transmitted infections among female sex workers in Kinshasa, Democratic Republic of Congo, in 2002. Sex Transm Dis 2007; 34:203-8.
- 96. Wang C, Hawes SE, Gaye A *et al.* HIV prevalence, previous HIV testing, and condom use with clients and regular partners among Senegalese commercial sex workers. Sex Transm Infect 2007; 83:534-40.
- 97. Vu Thuong N, Van Nghia K, Phuc Hau T *et al.* Impact of a community sexually transmitted infection/HIV intervention project on female sex workers in five border provinces of Vietnam. Sex Transm Infect 2007; 83:376-82.

- 98. Xu JJ, Wang N, Lu L *et al.* HIV and STIs in clients and female sex workers in mining regions of Gejiu City, China. Sex Transm Dis 2008; 35:558-65.
- 99. Ngo TD, Laeyendecker O, Li C *et al*. Herpes simplex virus type 2 infection among commercial sex workers in Kunming, Yunnan Province, China. Int J STD AIDS 2008; 19:694-7.
- 100. Wang H, Chen RY, Ding G *et al.* Prevalence and predictors of HIV infection among female sex workers in Kaiyuan City, Yunnan Province, China. Int J Infect Dis 2009; 13:162-9.
- 101. Folch C, Esteve A, Sanclemente C *et al.* Prevalence of human immunodeficiency virus, Chlamydia trachomatis, and Neisseria gonorrhoeae and risk factors for sexually transmitted infections among immigrant female sex workers in Catalonia, Spain. Sex Transm Dis 2008; 35:178-83.
- 102. Van Veen MG, Götz HM, van Leeuwen PA, Prins M, van de Laar MJ. HIV and Sexual Risk Behavior among Commercial Sex Workers in the Netherlands. Arch Sex Behav 2010; 39:714-23
- 103. Linhart Y, Shohat T, Amitai Z *et al.* Sexually transmitted infections among brothel-based sex workers in Tel-Aviv area, Israel: high prevalence of pharyngeal gonorrhoea. Int J STD AIDS 2008; 19:656-9.
- 104. Strathdee SA, Lozada R, Semple SJ *et al.* Characteristics of female sex workers with US clients in two Mexico-US border cities. Sex Transm Dis 2008; 35:263-8.
- 105. Imade G, Sagay A, Egah D *et al*. Prevalence of HIV and other sexually transmissible infections in relation to lemon or lime juice douching among female sex workers in Jos, Nigeria. Sex Health 2008; 5:55-60.